

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

1 DECEMBER 2020

Present: Councillor Patel (Chairperson)
Councillors Derbyshire, Owen Jones, Jackie Parry, Parkhill,
Owen, Sandrey and Wong

28 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillor Lancaster.

29 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

30 : ONE PLANET CARDIFF

The Committee received a report providing an opportunity to scrutinise the content of the Draft One Planet Cardiff Strategy which was received by Cabinet on the 15 October 2020. Members were asked to consider the views of a range of stakeholders on the recently published document. A copy of the Draft One Planet Cardiff Strategy was attached to the report as Appendix 1. The Cabinet report sought approval for the Draft One Planet Cardiff Strategy as the Council's initial response to the declared Climate Emergency. The report also sought authorisation to commence a period of public consultation to help shape a final strategy and action plan for approval in Spring 2021.

The Council recognises the scale of the challenges associated with climate change and has declared a Climate Emergency. The Draft One Planet Cardiff Strategy has been prepared as a strategic response to this declaration. The Strategy contains a vision that:

- Sets out Council's 10 year ambition to be Carbon Neutral in its own activities;
- Calls on the whole city, all citizens, young and old, schools, key partners, employers and stakeholders to positively work with the Council to develop a City-Wide road map and action plan for a carbon neutral City by 2030;
- Identifies opportunities that could reframe the Cardiff economy in a way that is resilient, robust and long-term, ensuring that Cardiff is one of the leading United Kingdom green cities; and,
- Defines the immediate programmes and opportunities that we urgently need to address.

Members were advised that the strategy document analysed the scope and scale of the challenge facing the Council and the city, and highlighted the opportunities that could arise from positive action. It also outlined the significant progress that the Council had made to date and proposed a wide range of immediate and potential actions that could form the basis of a longer term response to the climate emergency. Furthermore, as the development of the strategy had coincided with the Covid-19 emergency the development of the strategy had a renewed focus, highlighting the projects and opportunities that could stimulate a 'green recovery' with the Council at

the forefront of a green and inclusive economy, supporting both environmental and economic recovery in Wales.

Part 1

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader and Councillor Michael Michael, Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling and the Environment to the meeting. The Cabinet Members were invited to make statements.

Councillor Huw Thomas thanked the Committee for the time they have given to consider this item and the representatives of outside groups for their participation. The Council declared a climate emergency last year and the Leader was keen to ensure that this was not merely a symbolic gesture, but something that resulted in action. The administration has an ambition to make the Council and the city carbon neutral by 2030 by using its powers of convening to galvanise the public, businesses and organisations in the city to join this agenda. Members were advised that there had been positive preliminary conversations with public sector partners. The consultation period would be important in terms of how businesses could play their part in supporting the agenda.

Councillor Michael Michael stated that the One Planet strategy was launched recently and there was a lot of interest from stakeholders. It was important to engage with public sector partners and businesses during the consultation. The Cabinet Member highlighted the importance of the consultation to be undertaken. He was pleased to see representations from the Youth Council and Members were advised that he had instructed officers consider how the administration could better engage with school pupils, particularly in the 13-15 age bracket.

The Chairperson invited the Committee to comment, seek clarification, comment on, or raise questions on the information received. The discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members asked whether the One Planet Cardiff strategy had been drafted in partnership with the Public Sector Board or whether it was a Council document. The Leader advised that the strategy was 'Council-led', however, PSB partners had indicated their support both for the existence of the strategy and for the direction of travel. There are already good examples where PSB partners have worked on parts of the climate change agenda, including air quality initiatives and a shared travel policy across the public sector in Cardiff.
- Members questioned how many Council officers were dedicated to searching for and applying for grants to address the climate change emergency. The Director of Planning, Transport and Environment advised that there are six members of staff in the immediate team, but the whole Council would be asked to adopt the principles of the One Planet Cardiff strategy.
- Members asked how children and young people could be engaged with during the consultation exercise. The Cabinet Member for Recycling, Clean Streets and Environment stated that officers were working on a policy for engaging with young people.

- The Cabinet Members were asked to share the initial thoughts on how to achieve 'buy in' from members of the public. The Cabinet Member for Recycling, Clean Streets and Environment stated that early indications are there has already been considerable 'buy in' from the public. There are ways to better engage with the public and a whole variety of methods will be undertaken in order to consult as widely as possible. The Leader stated that 'buy in' of children and young people was crucial. The Leader considered that changes to the curriculum introduced by the Welsh Government lend themselves to this area of work, in terms of getting young people engaged with the challenges in their local environment.
- Members noted that the revised LDP would not be completed for some time, and that there were currently a lot of new houses being built which could potentially exacerbate existing problems. Members asked whether discussions were being undertaken with developers around how to build more sustainable housing. Members were advised that building standards are always increasing and the revised LDP would bring forward further improvements. The Leader accepted the point and stated that this is why it was critical to review the LDP at this point in time. However, there are issues of national policy and it was important not to disincentivise house building. A revised LDP would enable the authority to codify policy in relation to this agenda. The Director of Planning, Transport and Environment stated that developing both the revised LDP and the One Planet Cardiff strategy allowed for the two strategies to be inter-linked in terms of the priorities and focus on the green agenda, well-being and the wider One Planet Cardiff commitments. Officers are in conversation with strategic developers in terms of alignment with the One Planet Cardiff agenda, but the Council also has some existing developments of its own.
- Members asked how delivery the One Planet Cardiff strategy would be measured and monitored. Officers advised that some parts of the agenda, for example emissions from the estate, are measurable and there is good data to support this. However, elements of the strategy are new initiatives so officers have been tasked with finding better ways of modelling and monitoring prior to the publication of the final strategy. The Director of Planning, Transport and Environment stated that the strategy aimed to understand the value of projects in terms of carbon reduction, and their impact on the 'green economy' in the city and wider region.
- Members asked whether One Planet Cardiff would take precedent over other strategies and plans. The Leader stated that there was a balance to be struck around how this strategy interfaces with other priorities. Consideration is being given to including an environmental implications section in all Cabinet reports, in addition to legal and financial implications. There would also be a cultural change in terms of how the Council takes decisions.
- A Member raised concerns regarding the quality and sustainability of new housing developments in the city. The Member considered that final One Planet Cardiff strategy should make clear how utilities and services would be provided in new developments. The Cabinet Members for Recycling, Clean Streets and Environment stated that new housing developments start with basic infrastructure. Other utilities and services are delivered in a phased manner as people move into their homes. There are plans in place to deliver schools, shopping centres and community centres, etc. in those new developments. The Cabinet Member

considered that it was unreasonable to expect developers to deliver such facilities before anyone was living on those sites. The Director of Planning, Transport & Environment stated that the master plans for those developments had been commended as models for sustainability.

- Members questioned whether developers were planting enough new trees to offset the numbers of trees lost during construction of new housing developments in the city. The Cabinet Member for Recycling, Clean Streets and Environment stated that there were over a million trees in Cardiff, and that more trees are being planted than are removed. The Director of Planning, Transport & Environment stated that the One Planet Cardiff strategy aimed to create an 'urban forest' in Cardiff and increase the tree canopy for 20%.
- A Member asked whether the One Planet Cardiff concept would need be explained to residents. The Cabinet Member for Recycling, Clean Streets and Environment considered that people understood the concept of the strategy and the climate change emergency.

Part 2

A number of stakeholder groups were invited to provide a written submission to the Committee based on the content of the Draft One Planet Strategy. Each stakeholder group was given a 20 minute window to answer questions on the Draft One Planet Cardiff Strategy and the submission that they had provided. The key points made by the stakeholders are summarised as follows:

Cardiff University

- Welcomed the 2030 target, explaining that the 2050 target wasn't immediate enough.
- Cardiff University was at the same point as the Council, i.e. they were developing a strategy to deal with Climate Change. This presented an excellent opportunity for collaboration.
- Scope 3 emissions are the greatest challenge, i.e. those that happen because of actions but which cannot directly be influenced. Scope 3 represents a high percentage of the Cardiff University emissions.
- The strategy needed to provide clear linkages to the Wellbeing of Future Generations goals.
- Focusing more on water use would be a useful addition to the strategy.
- They considered that more focus was needed on behaviour change, as this targets the public and the changes that they need to make. Behaviour change is key and the University is keen to work with the Council on this. Behaviour change doesn't happen overnight.
- Covid – people are ultimately very adaptable and the rapid changes made during the pandemic demonstrates this.
- The pandemic has shifted us to more home working; this means more importance has been placed on the local environment. Planning has to reflect this move and places need to be designed to reflect the changing living and working patterns. Masterplans need to be reviewed regularly to reflect changing trends, they should not be set in stone.

- The strategy contains some high level aims, but then goes straight to a summary of projects. A link on how to get from one to the other, along with a plan needs to be provided.
- Food theme is very important and needs to be a key focus, i.e. expand the theme.
- Carrot works better than stick for behaviour change. The Council and partners need to think about this when developing a strategy, as it is important to sell the positives and not focus on the negatives.
- Agreed that the battle for climate change will be won or lost in schools.
- Important to define ownership and accountability. Find out how best to maximise both.
- Unsure about urban tree farm. More detail required.
- We need to find a way of linking the work of students into the community. Community groups get free resources and students get experience.

Dwr Cymru

- Supportive of the document.
- People and society are very adaptable, just look at how quickly Dwr Cymru and other organisations have adapted to Covid crisis, for example, working from home.
- Science helped deal with the challenges faced during Covid, for example, testing for the disease in the water supply.
- An engagement plan to deal with the changes that society needs to make is required. Behaviour change takes time, start engagement now.
- A water consumption per head target is needed. In Copenhagen they aimed to change from 140 litres per day to 100 litres per day. Managing used water has a big impact on CO2 emissions for water companies.
- Biggest impact that we can have is to disconnect water from water drains and pass back into the water course, similar to Greener Grangetown. This means retrofitting streets and roads to better help manage surface water. This would be very expensive.
- Biggest CO2 impact from water is from heating and washing water. Behaviour change is needed from the public in this area.
- Partnership working is important and a good example is Greener Grangetown. This only works well when you break down walls and work beyond your organisation.
- A key part of partnership working is to establish a set of rules and governance at the start.
- One Planet Cardiff needs to highlight a bigger link between climate change and water, not just in how we use it, but also from some of the associated implications. Need to think about a 'Blue Green Strategy' similar to the type used in Copenhagen and other North American cities. These look at the whole system impact, and if applied will have a significant impact (particularly cost) on the planning system.
- Government intervention to promotes rules and initiatives works, for example, the 5p bag tax. People generally react well to schemes that project a clear environmental benefit, plus it works well when the proceeds are reinvested back into dealing with the problem. The best schemes are simple and easy to relate to and understand.

- Need to avoid creating the false impression that the Council can solve the problem on its own. If the public thinks it can they will leave it to the Council, this will stall progress.
- Important to work with well-meaning community groups to share the message.

Labour for a Green New Deal

- Welcomed the document and very supportive of it.
- The strategy won't work if it is just top down, it needs to be owned and delivered by the public, with support from Council and other bodies.
- Covid and Climate Change have a disproportionately large impact on the poor.
- People are adaptable as has been demonstrated during the pandemic. Society is also capable of being very creative in finding solutions to the problems faced.
- For Low Traffic Neighbourhoods to succeed they need to be planned properly with public support, not imposed on them.
- An advocate of free public transport - 40% of bus journeys in London are on freedom passes.
- Suggested that the Leeds Climate Forum was a model worth following. Forum meets twice a year and gives the public a voice.
- Prioritisation needs to be applied to statutory issues, for example, retrofit of homes and reducing the number of vehicles on our streets.
- Important to use planning to better protect trees and need to get developers to build around and retain existing trees.

Natural Resources Wales

- Welcomed the strategy and its aims. Links into aims and a recent statement made by NRW.
- NRW is keen to explore partnership working, at the same time the organisation is going through a process of changing how it is structured and works.
- Covid stressed the importance of local green spaces and shone a light on inequality. Need to find a way to reduce these inequalities while adapting to the new way of working.
- Food is a priority. Needs to be tackled at a regional level. Uncertainty around the sustainable farming scheme presents a challenge. Changes in this area could be a good way to improve local food supply.
- Water needs to be a higher priority of the strategy; there is lots of carbon embedded in how we use water and how waste water is managed.
- Tree planting – lots that NRW can bring to this as they have a national tree planting programme, but less experience of urban tree planting.
- Need to work on new measures to show the value of green spaces.
- Engagement Lessons Learnt – you don't ever get it 100% right. Can only explain well and provide regular communication. Need to work with groups, bring in expertise and listen to the people.
- Biggest problems on the Wentlog Levels is dealing with anti-social behaviour.
- Greener Grangetown is a good example of partnership working, more projects similar to this could be delivered but they would all be different and so need to be assessed separately.
- Linked better local food production to area statements.

Size of Wales

- Welcomed the strategy and the target. Pleased to be able to feed into it.
- Cannot ignore the carbon emissions that caused in other parts of the world through things like deforestation. The awareness of this needs to be a key part of the strategy. Crops like soya, beef, coffee and chocolate have a very big carbon footprint as a result of deforestation.
- Becoming a fair trade Council or city helps with this.
- Important to deal with consumption issues, i.e. we consume three times more than the planet can support.
- Covid - humans are ultimately resilient and adaptable.
- Look at what we invest in, first comes a commitment, then a timescale. These things don't happen instantly.
- Making changes to our supply chain can have a big impact, i.e. we dictate terms onto suppliers who have to adapt and comply.
- Need to look to achieve a low carbon local food supply.
- Consider the Chester Zoo approach to making Chester a sustainable palm oil free city.
- Important to work with industry, and not against them.
- Meat free Fridays - balance between the big projects and the small things that drive behaviour change.
- They would like the Council to commit to becoming deforestation free.

Sustrans

- Covid – possible to change and adapt behaviour. Important to lock in some of the changes produced during the Covid lockdown, for example, carry on developing safer routes for cycling and walking.
- Low Traffic Neighbourhoods are a good idea. Need to be planned with the community to make the smoothest transition. There will always be some resistance.
- EV points – not something that Sustrans really promotes, except for use with car clubs. Electric cars still create congestion and pollution. Need to look at the mixed message around electric vehicles.
- Built environment and transport sections of strategy need to be linked.
- Bus patronage - how to increase numbers - cleaner buses will help.
- Don't tell people that they can't have a car, but make it easier not to need one.
- Important to work with neighbouring local authorities.
- Bike storage facilities are important, especially in less affluent areas where living space is limited.
- E-cargo bikes could work, need to explore this area with local authority and business partners.

Wales & West Utilities

- Hope to have a network that is net zero ready by 2035; this will mean that the gas network will be able to take 100% hydrogen. The general direction of travel here is for sustainable heating.
- Hydrogen capture technology already exists and is being used, for example, in the north sea.

- Back-up systems like fuel pumps are very useful.
- Milford Haven set up to be a carbon capture centre in the future.
- Some of this supply will be able to fuel hydrogen vehicles.
- Hydrogen is at least as safe as gas, if not safer.
- Retrofit is an important part of the future of gas; hybrid boilers are here and need to be considered when making purchases today, particularly for bigger commercial boilers – procurement needs to reflect this.
- These proposals are being reviewed by the Cardiff Capital Region.
- Hydrogen supply is there, comes from existing industrial sources, can be produced from renewables and carbon capture can be used. The long term aim is to have all hydrogen sustainably produced, but in reality this is a long way off.

Wales Co-operative Centre

- Welcomed the proposals.
- Important to have good representation from business community.
- Important to work with the local business community and social enterprises to help develop a greener supply chain. They can do it, but they might need a bit more support and guidance from authorities to achieve this at the outset.
- Retrofit could be a huge opportunity in Wales. Matching this to the local supply chain requires lots of forward planning.
- 75% of social enterprises value the local environment over cost.
- Social enterprises are often overlooked, and not always engaged with because of the profit motive.
- Commented on the importance of digital inclusion.

Welsh Government Energy Services

- Positive target welcomed.
- Need to understand how to build the obligations of this strategy into the work of all Council / public sector employees.
- Resources are scarce at the moment, and so need to focus on where the biggest 'bang for buck' can be achieved. The team that the Council has works well, but far more resource is needed to tackle such a huge challenge.
- A huge costed and worked through programme needs to be brought forward to show what needs to be done.
- Academics believe that the actions taken in the next 15 years will be the most consequential for humans.
- Cardiff Capital Region Cabinet is receiving an energy plan on the 7 December.
- The UK timeline is 2050, when the proposed one for this strategy is 2030. This might have delivery and funding consequences.
- Agreed to supply the marine project information.

The Chairperson thanks the Cabinet Members, officers and representatives from stakeholder groups for their contributions to the scrutiny of this item.

At the close of the meeting the Chairperson confirmed that the way forward will be considered at a meeting on the 8 December.

31 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

No urgent items were received.

The meeting terminated at 8.30 pm